

## Revision of Pay Scale of Lighting Assistants of Doordarshan at par with Assistant Cameraman of Films Division

The 3 different posts of Assistant Cameraman in *Films Division*, Lighting Assistant in *Doordarshan* and the Technician in *AIR & Doordarshan* are comparable posts and have been performing similar works, though they belong to different media units under Ministry of Information & Broadcasting. In fact, the Technicians of AIR & Doordarshan are better qualified and have more onerous duties to perform than the Assistant Cameraman and Lighting Assistant. The Lighting Assistants of Doordarshan were being recruited on *contract basis* upto age of 55/60 years and treated as *staff artists* and were given *fee scale* instead of pay scale. All the 3 posts carried same pay scale or *fee scale* upto the 2<sup>nd</sup> Pay Commission (till 31.12.1972). By an order dated 09.03.1977, the Govt. revised the *fee scales* of Staff Artists (Sound Recordist, Lighting Assistant etc) of Doordarshan on the analogy of recommendation of 3<sup>rd</sup> Pay Commission made in respect of *regular* Govt. employees and made it effective from 01.01.1973.

The 3<sup>rd</sup> Pay Commission (effective from 01.01.1973) granted *higher pay scale* of **Rs. 425-15-500-EB-15-560-20-700** to Assistant Cameraman of Films Division in comparison to pay scale of **Rs. 330-8-370-10-400-EB-10-480** granted to Technician of AIR & DD and Lighting Assistant of DD. Similar discrimination was made by the 3<sup>rd</sup> Pay Commission in giving higher pay scales to Cameraman and Recordist of Films Division than to their counterparts Cameraman Gr-II and Sound Recordist of Doordarshan. This has led to filing of following 3 Writ Petitions by staff of Doordarshan before Supreme Court of India:

1. Sound Recordist filed Writ Petition (Civil) No. 974 in year 1978.
2. Cameraman Gr-II filed Writ Petition (Civil) No. 1239 in year 1979 and,
3. Lighting Assistant filed Writ Petition (Civil) No. 1756 in 1986.

All the 3 WP(C) were clubbed and named as Y. K. Mehta & Others v/s UOI & Others and were decided by a single judgment dated 26.08.1988 by which the Lighting Assistants of DD were granted Assistant Cameraman's pay scale of **Rs. 425-15-500-EB-15-560-20-700** w.e.f. **01.12.1983**. Since the benefit of the order was allowed to petitioners only, the Cameraman Gr-II, Sound Recordists and Lighting Assistants of Doordarshan had to file another Writ Petition (Civil) No. 240 in 1989 before Supreme Court of India in the name of Doordarshan Cameraman's Welfare Association *not only for generalization of benefit of order dated 26.08.1988 to all, but also to allow it retrospectively from the dates of their appointments*. The WP(C) No. 240/1989 was allowed by order dated 12.04.1990 of Supreme Court *but only notional fixation was allowed prior to 01.12.1983*. The Lighting Assistants of DD were thus *notionally allowed* the pay scale of **Rs. 425-15-500-EB-15-560-20-700** w.e.f. 01.01.1973, but payment of arrears of pay was made w.e.f. 01.12.1983 onwards only. Ministry of I&B had finally revised the pay scale of Lighting Assistants of DD as below vide order dated 21.12.1988.

Name of Post : <b>Lighting Assistant in Doordarshan</b>		
Pay Scales ⇔ Period ↓	Pay scales recommended by the 3 <sup>rd</sup> & 4 <sup>th</sup> Pay Commissions	Pay scales at par with Assistant Cameraman revised by order of Supreme Court
From <b>01.01.1973</b> to <b>31.12.1985</b>	<b>Rs.330-8-370-10-400-EB-10-480</b> (3 <sup>rd</sup> Pay Commission)	<b>Rs.425-15-500-EB-15-560-20-700</b>
From <b>01.01.1986</b> to <b>31.12.1995</b>	<b>Rs.1200-30-1440-EB-30-1800</b> (4 <sup>th</sup> Pay Commission)	<b>Rs.1400-40-1800-EB-50-2300</b>

After the parity in pay scales between Assistant Cameraman (Films Division) and Lighting Assistant (Doordarshan) got established upto 31.12.1995 with the intervention of Supreme Court, the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission **further upgraded** pay scale of Assistant Cameraman

(Films Division) from existing pay scale of Rs. 4500-125-7000 (equivalent pay scale corresponding to pay scale of **Rs.1400-40-1800-EB-50-2300** of 4<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission) to **Rs. 5000-150-8000** (equivalent pay scale corresponding to pay scale of **Rs.1600-50-2300-EB-60-2660** of 4<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission) *vide para 73.54 of the 5<sup>th</sup> CPC Report* which has *once again* disturbed the parity between the two comparable posts.

As for Recommendation of 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission for Lighting Assistant (Doordarshan) is concerned, it recommended at *para 73.51* of the report as below:

**“As for the Lighting Assistants , we suggest that they should have a three-grade structure. The post of Cameraman Gr-III in Doordarshan may be abolished and its incumbents adjusted in the proposed posts of Lighting Assistant Grade- I. We recommend the following three grades for the Lighting Assistants:**

Sr. No.	Existing Post with Scale of Pay	Proposed Posts	Proposed Pay Scale	Revised Pay Scale
1	Lighting Assistant ( Rs. 1400-2300)	Lighting Assistant Grrade- I	<b>Rs. 1600-2660</b>	Rs. 5000-8000
		Lighting Assistant Grrade -II	<b>Rs. 1400-2300</b>	Rs. 4500-7000
		Lighting Assistant Grrade- III	<b>Rs. 1320-2040</b>	Rs. 4000-6000

However, it did not find place in *accepted report* for Ministry of I&B at **Part – C** of CCS (Revised Pay) Rules, 1997 on the subject matter of **Revised Scales of Pay for certain posts in Ministries, Departments and Union Territories. It has not been implemented in Doordarshan as well.**

After the said upgradation of pay scale of Assistant Cameraman (Films Division) to Rs 5000-150-8000 by the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission, the Lighting Assistant (Doordarshan) once again approached court of law for maintaining parity in their pay scales by filing **OA No. 2386/2005** titled Sanjeev Kumar & Others v/s UOI & Others before CAT, New Delhi which was decided in their favour vide order dated **15.05.2007**. The Govt. challenged this decision of CAT before Delhi High Court by filing **Writ Petition (C) No. 6544/2007** which was disposed of by order dated **15.12.2010** in favour of **Lighting Assistants and with a modification (vide para. 16 of order) in CAT’s order dated 15.05.2007. The high Court allowed the pay scale of Rs. 5000-150-8000 of Assistant Cameraman (Films Division) to the post of Lighting Assistant (Doordarshan) w.e.f. 01.01.1996. The Govt. however implemented the order of CAT, New Delhi in case of the petitioner Lighting Assistants only.**

Then, another **OA No. 1700/2012** was filed by **24** Lighting Assistants working at various Doordarshan Kendras before CAT, New Delhi titled P. Satyanarayana Rao & Others v/s UOI & Others for extension of the benefit of the Tribunal’s judgment & order dated 15.5.12007 in the OA No.2386/2005 (Sanjeev Kumar and others vs. Union of India and others) which was upheld by the Delhi High Court’s judgment in the Writ Petition (Civil) No. 6544 of 2007 (D.G. Doordarshan and another vs. Sanjeev Kumar and others) dated 15.12.2010. This OA was decided in favour of the applicants vide CAT’s order dated **18.05.2012** and was implemented by DG:Doordarshan vide Order No. **10/2013** issued from File No. 2/1/2012-S.I.A, dated **18.03.2013**.

**All the orders of courts and the Government in the case of Lighting Assistants may be seen at *\*JUDGMENTS of Courts in various cases of AIR & Doordarshan and Revision of Pay Scales of Subordinate Engg. cadres of the uadee.org.***