

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL
PRINCIPAL BENCH**

**OA No.1700 of 2012
MA No.1406 of 2012**

New Delhi this the 18th day of May, 2012

Hon'ble Dr. Veena Chhotray, Member (A)
Hon'ble Dr. Dharam Paul Sharma, Member (J)

1. P. Satyanarayana Rao
S/o Late Sh. P. Sheshagiri Rao
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Hyderabad
R/o Plot No.108, Kamla Nagar,
Vanasthali Puram, Hyderabad - 500070.
2. Mohammed Saleem
S/o Late Shri Shaik Ibrahim
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Hyderabad
R/o 2-2/27/3/A, IVth Floor,
Rahat Nagar, Amberpet, Hyderabad-500013.
3. Mohammed Arif
S/o Sh. Mohammed Abbas
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Hyderabad
R/o 6-1-260, C/30, Old C.I.B. Qtrs.
Khairtabad, Hyderabad - 50004.
4. K. Ranganadha Rao,
S/o Late Sh. K. Pattabhi Ramanna
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Hyderabad
R/o H.No.20-10/1, beside Balaji Enclave,
Peerjadiguda Uppal, Ghatkesar Mandal,
Hyderabad-500039.
5. S. Satyanarayana Murthy
S/o Sh. S. Rama Murthy,
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Hyderabad
R/o 8-2-603/A/119/D Singadi Basti, Road-12,
Banjara Hills, Hyderabad-500038.

6. K. Bhaskar
S/o Late Sh. K. Yellaiah
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Hyderabad
R/o 10-4/7 Sreeram Nagar Colony,
Balaji Nagar, Shameerpet Mandal,
R.R. District, A.P.-500087.
7. Subhash Chand
S/o Late Sh. G.D. Dutt
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow
R/o 3A, Kushal Puri Colony,
Khargapur Gomti Nagar,
Lucknow (U.P.).
8. Ram Milan,
s/o late Shri Khushi Ram
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow
R/o 645A/205, Yashoda Vihar,
Madiya Village Road,
Jankipuram, Lucknow-226021 (U.P.)
9. Krishan Mohan Kashyap
S/o Late Shri Ram Dass
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow
R/o 5/7, Sanjay Gandhi Nagar,
Priyag Narain Road, Balu Adda,
Lucknow (U.P.).
10. Sultan Ahmed
S/o Late Sh. Ahmad Ali
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow
R/o H. No.A-1367/14, Indira Nagar,
Near Main Market, Lucknow (U.P.).
11. Pankaj Srivastav
S/o Sh. S. Lal Srivastav
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow
R/o C-211, Sector N, Kurci Road,
Aliganj, Lucknow (U.P.).
12. Krishan Chand Joshi,
S/o Late Shri L.N. Joshi,
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow
R/o 7A Youst Building,
Pandariko Char Bagh, Lucknow (U.P.).

13. Nand Kumar
S/o Sh. Kishori Lal
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Ranchi
R/o Balsiring Village P.O.
Hatia 834003, Ranchi, Jharkhand.
14. Prabodh Kumar Jha
S/o Late Sh. Mahabir Jha
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Ranchi
R/o Flat No.101, Ganga Apartments,
Asha Shree Garden, Morahabadi,
Ranchi-834008, Jharkhand.
15. Satish Kumar
S/o Late Shri Iswari Prasad Singh
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Ranchi
R/o Shivajee Nagar, Harmu Colony,
Ranchi-834012, Jharkhand.
16. Sarjun Das
S/o Late Sh. Shiv Charan Das
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Ranchi
R/o Radha Nagar, Kaju Bagan, Hehal,
Ranchi-834002, Jharkhand.
17. Naresh Kumar
S/o Late Sh. Prem Chand
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Hissar
R/o RZ D-22, West Sagar Pur,
Delhi-110046.
18. Parveen Asthana
S/o Late Sh. K.K. Asthana,
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Allahabad
R/o 16, Shiv Kutti, Near Aparan Chowk,
Allahabad, U.P.
19. Rishi Bindroo
S/o Sh. Girdhari Lal Bindu
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Allahabad
R/o BO-4, Doordarshan Colony,
Near Carpatri Chowk, Allahabad, U.P.

20. Rajiv Kumar
S/o Sh. Anil Kumar
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Chandigarh
R/o 38, Sector-42A, DDK Colony,
Chandigarh.
21. Aadarsh Kumar Divedi,
S/o Late Shri P. Divedi,
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Mathura
R/o B-6, Aakashwani Colony,
Radhapuram, Vrindavan Road,
Mathura.
22. Charu Chandra Joshi
S/o Sh. J.C. Joshi
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Dehradun
R/o Near A-1333/1, Indira Nagar,
Lucknow, (U.P.).
23. Bali Ram Singh
S/o Late Sh. Harivansh Singh,
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Baraily
R/o Bati Traders, Badhu Road,
Near Doordarshan Colony,
Bareilly, U.P.
24. Raj Kishor
S/o Sh. Hori Lal,
Working as Lighting Assistant,
Doordarshan Kendra, Mau
R/o C-7, Doordarshan Colony,
Parda Mill Road, Mau, U.P.

.... Applicants

(By Advocate Shri Yogesh Sharma)

VERSUS

1. Union of India through the Secretary,
Ministry of Information & Broadcasting,
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
2. The Director General of Doordarshan,
Doordarshan Bhawan, Mandi House,
Copernicus Marg, New Delhi.
3. The Deputy Director General (Admn.)
Doordarshan Bhawan, Mandi House,
Copernicus Marg, New Delhi.

.... Respondents

O R D E R (O R A L)

Dr. Veena Chhotray, Member (A) :

The Applicants (24 in number) are working as Lighting Assistants under various Doordarshan Kendras. They are seeking grant of pay scale i.e. Rs.5000-8000 (pre-revised) w.e.f. 1.1.1996 by extending the benefit of the Tribunal's judgment vide its order dated 15.5.2007 in the OA No.2386/2005 (Sanjeev Kumar and others vs. Union of India and others) which was upheld by the Delhi High Court's judgment in the Writ Petition (Civil) No.6544 of 2007 (D.G. Doordarshan and another vs. Sanjeev Kumar and others) dated 15.12.2010.

2. The Tribunal vide its aforesaid order had issued the following directions:-

13. Resultantly, for the foregoing reasons, OA is partly allowed. Impugned order is set aside. Respondents are directed to reconsider grant of pay scale on established comparability of applicants with Assistant Cameramen of Film Division in the pay scale of Rs.5000-8000 w.e.f. 1.1.1996. The aforesaid shall culminate into a reasoned order to be passed within two months from the date of receipt of a copy of this order. Needless to mention that the consequences would ensue.

The Hon'ble Delhi High Court modified the Tribunal's directions slightly while disposing the aforesaid Writ petition filed by the respondents by passing the following directions:-

- (i) The claimants before the Tribunal i.e. the respondents before us would be entitled to be placed in the same pay-scale as their counterparts in the Films Division were placed and equivalence would be as per the two decisions of the Supreme Court noted herein above.
- (ii) Upon being placed in the correct pay-scale, the respondents would be liable to be in the minimum of the pay-scale with effect from the date of regularization and needless to state further increments would be earned as per law.

Copies of both these judgments have been enclosed with the OA.

3. The benefit of the claimed pay scale has been granted to the applicants in the said OA by the respondents vide order dated 26.4.2012 (Annexure A/1). As a consequence to these developments, the applicants made representations to the Director General, Doordarshan. Copies of these representations have been enclosed as Annexure A/4 (pages 47-92).

4. Shri Yogesh Sharma, learned counsel appearing for the applicants would submit that despite these representations and also approaching the authorities personally, there has not been any positive response in favour of the applicants even though they are similarly situated to the persons, who have been granted the benefit of the higher pay scale. The learned counsel would also submit that at this stage, the applicants would be satisfied, if a time bound direction for considering the representations of the applicants is issued to the Director General, Doordarshan.

5. Considering the facts and circumstances of the case and the submissions made by the learned counsel for the applicants, we are of the view that the OA can be disposed in limine. The Director General, Doordarshan (respondent no.2) is directed to consider the representations of the applicants along with the OA as a supplementary representation and pass a speaking and

reasoned order within a period of two months from the date of receipt of a certified copy of this order. The order so passed should also be conveyed to the applicants. Registry is directed to ensure service of a copy of our order along with a copy of the OA to the respondent no.2.

(Dr. Dharam Paul Sharma)
Member (J)

(Dr. Veena Chhotray)
Member (A)